



« EQUALITY, A STRATEGY TO INTEGRATE AND ENABLE PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES »

Odessa, Ukraine

Period of implementation: 1991 (launch) | Study case written in 2010

OGOIN, an NGO of people with disabilities of Odessa, was created on 28 May 1989. In 1990, several members of OGOIN were elected as members of the municipal assembly, which led to the creation of the City Committee on People with disabilities Issues – the only one in Ukraine – and to the adoption in 1991 of the municipal program named 'Equality' which is still operating. The main objective of the program is to facilitate the life of people with limited physical abilities and to provide them access to different objects of the municipal infrastructure (public spaces, social use, or housing), to create a barrier-free environment in the city. Representatives of people with disabilities's organizations are regularly invited for the Committee's sessions in order to analyze the program's successes and failures and to collect proposals for further actions, including the creation of a list of items that need to be developed through the municipal budget. The Committee on People with disabilities's Issues was created at the City Hall in 1998.



The **Inclusive Cities Observatory** was launched in 2008 by the UCLG Committee on Social Inclusion, Participatory Democracy and Human Rights with the aim of creating a space for analysis and reflection on local social inclusion policies. The initiative was developed with the scientific support of Professor Yves Cabannes (University College of London) and the Centre for Social Studies (CES) from the University of Coimbra. At present, the Observatory contains more than sixty study cases mostly developed between 2008 and 2010. Even though many of these cases refer to policies that have already come to an end, they still have much to offer: from capitalizing on the learning acquired by other local authorities to discovering suggestive and alternative means to address social inclusion challenges from a local perspective.

Context

City context

Odessa is a city of 1,009,204 inhabitants within a metropolitan area population of about 2,386,000, and is the fifth largest city in the Ukraine (National Statistics Committee in Odessa Region). Odessa is one of Ukraine's largest sea ports and one of its important industrial centers, with large enterprises in the chemical, oil rig, and food industries, among other sectors. The city is also important for its recreational potential and historical heritage, which make it one of the biggest touristic attractions on the Northern Black Sea coast.

Governmental decentralization context

In Ukraine, the fundamentals of local self-government were shaped by the Constitution of 1996 and by the law 'On Local Self-Government in Ukraine' (21 May 1997). The documents proclaim the principles of decentralization of public powers and the priority of territorial units or communities known as *gromada*, but these principles have not been fully implemented. Thus, a mixed system currently exists, combining local state government and local self-government on the levels of districts (*raion*) and regions (*oblast*). On one side, provincial and district councils are elements of local self-government, representing the interests of territorial *gromadas*; on the other side, there are state administrations of provinces and districts, which are local organs of state executive power vested with the executive functions of these councils. Such a combination of municipal and state structures actually derogates principles of local self-government, leaving it in the domain of state rule.

Reform projects have faltered because of political divisions and are still pending. In Ukraine, the administrative-territorial organization has a three-tier structure: the highest level includes the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 26 regions, and two cities, Kiev and Sevastopol, both having a special status. The next level, the upper municipal level, embraces 490 districts and district cities. The lowest level includes city districts, cities of district subordination, towns, settlements, and villages.

Bodies of local self-government may establish, in accordance with the law, local taxes and duties, which are allocated to appropriate budgets. In Ukraine, health services, education, and social protection represent more than 80% of public expenditures at the local level. Furthermore, Ukrainian local authorities manage communal property and local finances, ensure development of appropriate territories, provide services to the population, ensure participation of the population in civic life, and protect public order.

Institutional level of policy: Municipal.

Social context

There are more than 48,000 adults (approximately 5.5% of the total population, which corresponds to the Ukrainian average) and almost 3,000 children with different disabilities living in the city of Odessa today.¹

Policy development

¹ <http://www.odessa.ua/ru/news/31222/>

The program for integrating people with disabilities in Odessa exists today as a municipal program called 'Equality', which aims to create a barrier-free city environment for people with limited physical abilities by remodelling the city's infrastructure, constructing special facilities, and establishing municipal services for people with disabilities.

The program is unique in Ukraine in two ways: first, the high level of its institutionalization (the existence of a specific political committee at City Hall) and, second, its participatory character, although rather weak, which is still very rare in Ukraine. Currently, Odessa is the only city in Ukraine running such a program and the most disabled-friendly city in the country.

Background

The origins of the current 'Equality' policy in Odessa are rooted in the commitment of OGOIN – an 'umbrella' Organization of People with disabilities in the City of Odessa. This is a non-governmental and non-profit organization created by a group of people with disabilities in Odessa in May 1989 and registered at Odessa Municipal Councils on 20 July 1989. The main objectives of the organization are to promote the civil rights of people with disabilities and to help people with disabilities achieve an equal level of social participation as non-people with disabilities.

The need for such an organization emerged from the collapse of the USSR's employment and social model, where the state took all the responsibility for social care and the state's people with disabilities organizations provided guaranteed working places for people with disabilities. For example, almost all small electrical equipment, such as switches and sockets, was produced by the Blind Society workshops. After the collapse of the Soviet Union, these workshops suffered a lot within market economy conditions, losing profits in market competition, and many blind people have lost their jobs.

In order to study the experience, OGOIN contacted several people with disabilities' organizations in Odessa's sister cities and, at the end of 1990, organizational representatives participated in the Scandinavian People with disabilities Congress in Oulu, Finland, one of Odessa's 28 sister cities. In Oulu they saw a city full of facilities for people with disabilities, ramparts, parking spaces, elevators, and lots of special techniques for building toilets and designing public spaces.

Since then, the guiding objective has been to find a way to approximate the living conditions of Odessa's people with disabilities to what were imagined as the 'existing European standards', and the idea of realizing a particular program on a municipal level arose.

Policy objectives

Since the beginning, OGOIN's management has believed there were three main components necessary to change the system of relationships between the state and people with disabilities:

1. The development of documents regulating the relationship between people with disabilities and state and municipal authorities;
2. Involvement of all municipal services (including those in charge of education, employment, and health care) in the re-equipment of the city infrastructure; and
3. The creation of a Committee on people with disabilities's problems within the City Council.

Chronological development and implementation of the practice

In order to achieve these goals, several subdivisions of the OGOIN organization in the Odessa districts were registered as separate organizations (due to the municipal elections law in force at that time). This strategy permitted the organization to present its candidates for in the elections of district councils and the city council in 1990. Three of the OGOIN candidates were elected at the district level, and one candidate was elected to the City Council. As members of the district and City Councils, they were able to help solve several problems through fighting from 'inside' the public institutions.

On 3-5 October 1990, OGOIN organized the first Congress of People with disabilities Organizations of Ukraine, and participated in elaborating the Ukrainian Law on people with disabilities's social protection.

Finally, OGOIN was a main contributor in elaborating the municipal program 'Equality', which was successfully approved during the City Council session on 14 March 1991. The realization of the program was slow and often incomplete, and the fight to see it concretely implemented still requires time and energies.

During the gas deficit in 1991, again on the initiative of OGOIN, the City Council created a 'mobile gas station for people with disabilities's cars'. Until the end of 1993 – thanks again to the pressure of various actions and mobilizations of OGOIN (including picketing in front of City Hall) – people with disabilities continued to get free gas through municipal gas cheques, even if the 'mobile gas station' had been dismantled by these later years.

In 1993, two specially equipped buses and 3 mini-buses were provided by City Hall in order to allow OGOIN to organize outdoor activities for people with disabilities, such as countryside excursions, theatre and exhibition visits, etc. On 1 July 1993, a municipal *Invataxi* service was created, which provides transportation services to hospitals and stations. The Assedo chess club was also created (it operated between 1989 and 1994 and closed because of mid-1990 economic difficulties in the country), as well as the Otrada music and poetry studio (operating since 1991) and the White Acacia arts studio (operating since 1993), which has already presented more than 25 exhibitions. Other new institutions opened under the 'Equality' program were: the Hope dating club (operating since 1995), the Lesia women's club (operating since 1995), the Dialogue youth club (operating since 1997), the Invapress Press Center (operating 1995-1996 and closed because of property redistribution within the city's media sector), and the Odessa-Basket wheelchair basketball club (operating since 2001). A national wheelchair basketball competition has been held since 2003.

In 1995 the first beach was equipped for people with disabilities's vehicles, with two additional equipped beaches established later on. This is an important accomplishment given that there normally is no shore-access for vehicles in Odessa, since traffic is prohibited in the beach zone.

In 1997, OGOIN won the Counterpart Consortium/Elwin Institute grant for 'Sustainable employment system creation' which enabled them to acquire computers and equipment in order to create professional courses on typing, accounting, advertising and design, and internet marketing which have been functioning until the present day. A significant proportion of the graduates have been employed. However, there is no continuous statistical data on course graduates and their future careers, so the overall impact of this activity cannot be estimated.

Following repeated efforts by OGOIN, in 1998 a Committee on People with disabilities's Issues was created at City Hall. On the basis of the Equality program elaborated previously, the Committee presented its proposals to the City administration, and the municipal program was successfully approved (City Council Decision No. 556) on 16 August 2001. Currently, Odessa is

the only city in Ukraine with such a Committee and operating a municipal program for defending rights of access to the city for people with disabilities.

Today, representatives of several people with disabilities's organizations are regularly invited to the Committee's sessions in order to analyze the program's successes and failures, and in order to collect proposals for further actions, including creating a list of objects that need to be build or developed through the municipal budget.

In order to facilitate the life of people with limited physical abilities and to provide them access to different objects of the municipal infrastructure (i.e., public spaces, social uses, or housing), the Municipal Council of Odessa approved Resolution No. 2160-V on 22 January 2008, adopting a new edition of the 'Equality' municipal program for 2008-2011 (Odessa Municipal Equality Program).

Within the framework of this program, the City plans to:

- Create a public control system to supervise the design and construction of housing and social facilities, streets and motorways, small city infrastructure objects, and advertising items with regards to people with disabilities's accessibility requirements;
- Build ramparts, handrails, and lifts in public areas, social buildings, and appropriate housing through the municipal budget and funds obtained from other sources;
- Provide traffic lights with sound signals, etc.;
- Start a municipal service station for vehicles and other technical devices for people with disabilities;
- Provide municipal transportation services for people with disabilities;
- Equip recreation places for people with disabilities on the city beaches;
- Promote social rehabilitation and employment; and
- Study the city infrastructure in order to provide efficiency and transparency in the funds used in future.

Stakeholders, beneficiaries and participatory methodologies

Agents involved

The Equality program was developed and implemented as a partnership between the City Council and several people with disabilities's NGOs, such as OGOIN and its institutional members (e.g., Society for the Blind, Society for the Deaf, Organization of Afghanistan War Veterans, etc.).

Beneficiaries

People with disabilities of Odessa and their families. Non-detailed annual reports can be found online at Odessa City Hall site² and The Report of Odessa Head Department on Labour and Social Protection (available online).

Participation processes implemented

The program contains elements of 'indirect' participation. The people with disabilities of the city present their requirements of local arrangements to their NGOs. The NGOs choose priorities

² <http://www.odessa.ua/ru/news/31744/>

for the most desired works, facilities, or services, and their regular representatives in the Municipal Committee on People with disabilities present them to be included into the Program's plan for the next year. Broader meetings with the NGO representatives are held quarterly in order to evaluate the program's implementation. Only NGO representatives can participate in these meetings, and people come to know about them through NGO representatives in specific places. Particular persons can address their requirements or complaints to the City Hall Committee; however, it mainly serves to specify particular failures of a program's implementation, or areas to pay special attention within the framework of the program already approved. No proceedings are publicly available for public consideration, which is a normal practice for municipal planning in Ukraine.

Institutionalizing and financing

Institutionalization processes

Since 1998, a Committee on People with disabilities's Issues has functioned at City Hall. On the basis of the Equality program elaborated previously, the Committee presented its proposals to the City administration, and the municipal program was successfully approved (City Council Decision No. 556) on 16 August 2001. Currently, Odessa is the only city in Ukraine with such a Committee and operating a municipal program for defending rights of access to the city for people with disabilities.

Based on the Law 'On Local Self-Government in Ukraine', Article 42, Odessa City Council implements a specified City Program 'Equity', which is renewed every 3 years. The current edition was approved by City Council Resolution No. 2160-V on 22 January 2008.

Financing

The program is financed by the municipal budget. The amounts planned initially were:

2009 – 1,373,865 hryvnias (approximately 139,478 euros³)

2010 – 1,265,640 hryvnias (or approximately 111,706 euros)

2011 – 1,271,140 hryvnias (or 117,807 euros)

In 2009, the program budget represented about 0.06% of total City budget expenses. In 2010, the allocation for the program dropped down significantly; however, in February 2010 the program received additional financing, doubling its overall costs to reach 2,600,000 hryvnias. At this level, the program costs came to represent about 0.06% of total municipal budget expenses again.

Unfortunately, it is not possible to estimate the value of private donations that surely exist. There is no public access to such information as long as NGOs don't want to make it public, and tax administrations aren't required to do so.

Outcomes and reflections

Key results and achievements

The overall results of the program can seem either quite modest or highly impressive, depending on one's base of comparison. Odessa is the only city in Ukraine with a political committee on

³ According to the exchange rate for 2009 provided by the National Bank of Ukraine: <http://bank.gov.ua/Engl/default.htm>

people with disabilities's Issues, the only city that continues to construct ramps in old buildings (where they were not constructed initially), the city with the highest number of traffic lights with sound signals in Ukraine (there are 58 traffic lights with sound signals in Odessa, while in Kiev there are only 30). According to a study by the Municipalities Institute conducted in February 2010, Odessa holds the top position in the 'life comfort level' ranking of Ukrainian cities. However, there are ongoing difficulties such as a lack of transparency in the use of funds (which is typical for Ukraine in general). As well, the municipal infrastructure is still extremely poor compared to most European cities, although in comparison to other large cities in Ukraine, Odessa enjoys the highest number of facilities for people with disabilities.

Overall assessment and replicability or adaptation elsewhere

Main obstacles

Apart from financial difficulties, several specific obstacles were faced. For example, the initial installation of traffic lights with sound signals failed because of a lack of certified equipment in Ukraine, and it took time to find the traffic lights abroad and to pass them through the certification process in Ukraine. Problems like this one can generally be explained as a result of the unpreparedness of local government institutions and local stakeholders to operate in a reformed environment, under conditions of a poor level of decentralization and a lack clearly defined responsibilities and competences for local governments and local communities. Together with high bureaucracy and corruption levels, these conditions create a large variety of formal bureaucratic obstacles for the implementation of any program.

Replicability or adaptation of policy elsewhere

The particular interest of this policy lies in its uniqueness in Ukraine: so far, it is the only city with a people with disabilities integration program that is both highly institutionalized and participative at the same time. In part, it was able to achieve its level of institutionalization due to some 'luck' and the quick actions of OGOIN representatives in 1989, when they managed to obtain some seats as Council members. The particularity of the practice that may not be directly replicated in other Ukrainian cities is that the national legislation in Ukraine does not allow NGO representatives to become candidates in municipal elections. But the scheme of a Committee in charge of people with disabilities's issues with the participation of organizational representatives is a mechanism that can be implemented in other places.

Further information

This case was researched and written by Olena Luchyna under the supervision of Dr. Giovanni Allegretti at the Centre for Social Studies, University of Coimbra, Portugal, in 2010.

UCLG Committee on Social Inclusion, Participatory Democracy and Human Rights

Website: <https://www.uclg-cisd.org/>

Contact information: cisd1@uclg.org | +34 933 42 87 70

Bibliography

Chernenko, Sergey (Head of Municipal Assembly People with disabilities's Committee).

Interview on the 'Equity' program implementation on Glas TV Channel.

<http://video.glasweb.com/>

National Statistics Committee in Odessa Region: <http://www.od.ukrstat.gov.ua/>

Odessa Municipal Equality Program: <http://www.odessa.ua/acts/council/12482/>

Organization of People with disabilities in the City of Odessa:

http://www.oqoin.odessa.net/800_600/ukr/home.html

Report of Odessa Head Department on Labour and Social Protection:

<http://gupszn.odessa.gov.ua/Main.aspx?sect=Page&IDPage=1591&id=135>

The 'Equity' Program working. "Odessky Vestnik", No.227-228, 2010.

<http://www.odvestnik.com.ua/issue/201/4563/>

The Implementation of 'Equity' Program. The View from Odessa. [http://od-](http://od-news.com/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=9158&Itemid=2)

[news.com/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=9158&Itemid=2](http://od-news.com/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=9158&Itemid=2)

United Cities and Local Governments, 2008, *First Global Report on Decentralization and Local Democracy* (GOLD Report). Barcelona: UCLG.

United Cities and Local Governments, 2010, *Local Government Finance: The Challenges of the 21st Century. Second Global Report on Decentralization and Local Democracy*. Barcelona: UCLG.